

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

1	Dr.NeerajRana (principal scientist ICAR KAB-II)		No weightage for the service rendered at ICAR headquarters rather score card is skewed in favour of scientist engaged in research /teaching/extensi on					
2	Dr. Raj Kumar Rai (Former Professor & Head)	Beyond PS score card criterion should be dispensed with. Instead of this 10 senior most scientist should be called.						
3	Dr. K Ponnusamy (NDRI Karnal)			Reduce Interview marks/Weightage needs to be given to special attainments instead of awards				
4	Dr. A K Vyas (ADG (HRM)KAB-II Pusa Campus)		Experience has not been recognised in score card. Minimum 8 marks for experience	Marks for award/special attainments overweighed.	Difficult to tell about extant of coverage of technology. Therefore, it should be supported by 2 year data publication in NAAS rated journal			Reduction of marks from 20 to 15

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

			should be given. 1 Mark for each year experience over and above the minimum experience should be given					
5	Dr.Navin K Jain (Principal Scientist KAB-II Pusa campus)	No weightage of academic qualification beyond PS. Thereafter all the scientist after the service period of 15-20 years should be treated equally competitive.	Experience should be given weightage. Minimum 10 marks for experience in relevant field		Difficult to workout the area of coverage by a particular Technology. So it may be deleted from Point No 4. Technology may be supported by data publication in NAAS rated journal/other publications			Reduction of marks to 15 in publication
6	Dr. Mahaveer P Sharma (Principal Scientist IISR Indore)	Score card criterion should be dispensed with for RMPs positions. Selection criterion on the pattern of ISRO, BARC,DAE,DRDO etc.						
7	Dr.Smita Sirohi (Principal Scientist NDRI Karnal)	Interview marks should be increased from PS onwards positions.						
8	Dr. K K Pal		Prior managerial		Marks to be allocated			

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

	(Principal Scientist ICAR DGR JUNAGADH)		experience is to be deleted for RMP position		accordingly for innovation technology etc.			
9	Dr. H P Maheswarappa (PROJECT COORDINATOR CPCRI KASARAGOD KERELE)							
10	Dr. Mrs K Sarla (Principal Scientist & Head CTRI Andhra Pradesh)	General Remarks: The proposed score card is disadvantageous to scientist working in remote institute/research institute/ people contributing for far level improvement						
11	Dr.(Smt)RavinderKaur (Principal Scientist ICAR Delhi)					Under item 5A.1 guidance provided for PhD may be reworded as guidance provided for MSc/PhD		
12	Dr. K N Singh (Head(FASM) IASRI Delhi)	General Remark: Old score card was much balanced.						

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
13	Dr. S N Jha (ADG ICAR KAB-II)	Marks for best master thesis awarded by any professional/ relevant scientific societies should be incorporated. Post doctoral fellowship/JSPS from Japan should also be included		There must be difference in award of marks for different awards/special attainments. Gold medal/fellowship/commendation medal/young scientist award /PG thesis award/team award of professional scientific societies should also be given 1 mark. Award such as best scientific oral/paper/poster papers giving in conferences should be given ½ mark each. Member secretary or member of RAC/ INC should also be kept as alternative for ½ marks with QRT member.			Engineering/Technology discipline have two year projects whereas in the present proposal marks will be given only for three year projects.It should be changed to 2 years for engineering and technology disciplines.	
14	Dr.Bimlesh Mann (Head NDRI Karnal Haryana)	Academics marks should be reduced to 3		Award section must be reduced to 2				
15	Dr Vijay Kumar Taneja (DDG)	General Remark: 60% marks for interview to be given. For RMP positions a person having vision to further	Marks for Experience have been reduced		20 marks for new criterion-developing varieties			

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

		strengthen the institute is required therefore it would be appropriate to retain 60 marks for interview for RMP position. To generate 20 marks for new criterion-developing varieties is aimed to recognize scientist who have contributed to development of varieties/breeds/technologies but this criterion is biased more in favour of scientist from fields of breeding/biotechnology and would put scientist from basic and social sciences to be at disadvantage.						
16	Dr. R S Gandhi (ADG KrishiBhavan Delhi)			Marks for national/international award are on lower side. On the lines of fellowship of national academy,4 marks for National academy of Dairy Science should be included				

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

17	Dr. C B Pandey (Principal Scientist & Head ICAR CAZRI)	Marks for academic qualification should be given not at the director level but at the entry level only	More marks to be given in Experience in professional field	Some international educational foundation like USIEF are not given due weightage	Products/processes/technologies should be supported by publications which have more than 10			
18	Dr.KAlgusundaram (Dy DG(Engg))	General Remarks: I. Separate criterion provisions should be made for the scientist placed at ICAR headquarters under item 4 to 7. II. The requirement of monetary value in item 2f,5c and 7a1 should be scaled and rationalised according to the time period inflation.	More weightage should be given for interview for the research management positions. Adequate weightage should be given for the experience of existing research management positions for the post of another research management positions under item 2 to 7	There must be difference in giving marks for Rafi Ahmed Kidwai Award/Shanti Swaroop Bhatnagar award/Nobel Prize/World food prize and any other award Gold medal/fellowship/commendation medal/young scientist award /PG thesis award/team award of professional scientific societies should also be given 1 mark it can kept as an alternative of national/international institutes/universities award. Award such as best scientific oral/paper/poster papers giving in conferences should be given ½ mark each. Member secretary or member of RAC/ INC should also be		Marks to be given to 2year project also at least for engineering and technology		

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

				kept as alternative for ½ marks with QRT member.				
19	Dr Y Ranjana Devi (Dy Director of instruction Imphal)			More Weightage for Individual Awards/50% for team award Maximum for award by national/international to be 5 instead of 3	More weightage to be given to given to this category			
20	Dr. Virender Kumar Bharti (Chief Production officer,DKMA KAB -1 PUSA Delhi)	General Remarks: I.PD,DKMA is specialized post having completely different mandate as compared to directors of research institute and hence specific model qualification and specific score card for this post should be considered. II The present eligibility criterion for PD,DKMA needs to be revised as possessing this type of experience and pay scale are rarely available in communication management field. This needs to be revised in suitable manner to open up the qualification for		Awards relevant to communication should be included in this category such as Choudhary Charan Singh Award for excellence in Journalism in agriculture research and development, Dr Rajender Prasad Award for technical books in Hindi in Agricultural and Life Sciences , MHRD awards, I&B Award and CSIR award.				

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

		other quality professional from the communication field so that they may also compete with PS/Professors. Note: With his comments Dr. Virender Bharti has also enclosed his suggestions from item no 1 to item no 7						
21	Dr. B Singh (Director ICAR-IIVR Varanasi)		Experience should be given more weightage	Marks for awards given by National Institutes/Universities/ professional societies should be enhanced.	Weightage should be given for all the items instead of each item			Multiplication factor should be increased to 0.08
22	Dr G A K Kumar (Scientist NRRRI Cuttak)		Head/ equivalent Position is not considered as RMP then how can a candidate score as per the score card for PD/Dir/JDNI/ADG in 2f					
23	Dr. N Rai (Principal Scientist IIVR Varanasi)		Service experiences should be given more weightage	Marks awarded for Awards by NI/Universities etc. should be enhanced	Weightage should be given for all items instead of each item.			Multiplication factor should be increased to

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

							0.08	
24	Dr.D V Singh (Principal Scientist ICAR-IISR Indore)	General Remarks: Score card for RMP positions should be abolished	Experience has not been recognised in the score card. Maximum marks to be raised to 20 from 10	Marks to be rationalized Fellowship/gold medal to be included	Marks assigned to coverage of technology is ambiguous rather it should be rated based on citations of those technologies/publications		Weightage should be reduced	
25	Dr.R K Pundir (Principal Scientist ICAR-NBAGR karnal)		Marks for experience over and above prescribed essential year as minimum qualification should be at least 3 marks		A provision may be made for identifying, characterising through systematic survey and then developing breed descriptors of different populations of livestock for registration as a new breed			
26	Dr.S S Giri (Principal Scientist & Head ICAR-CIFA Bhubaneswar)					As suggested under 5A1 for HOD/PC/NC post "whereas for minor function, the applicant must have taken 3 credit hr load/academy year" may also be mentioned under 5A1 forPD/Dir/ADG/ZPD/J DNI.		

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
27	Dr.Surender Kumar (Principal Scientist LBS Pusa Campus delhi)				There are no marks for International Patents. No marks for technologies commercialized at international level. No marks for Pilot Plant establishment for the new invention/machinery/tool invented and developed.			
28	Dr. S k Gupta (Professor & Head ILFC Jammu)	10 marks for Academics performance/Gold-Medal/PhD/MVSc/ Overseas fellowship	10yr professorship experience instead of 8 yrs		Marks in this category should be removed and should be redistributed in awards/books/publications		Weightage for publication should be increased	
29	Dr. S Manivannan (General Secretary ARSSF)S	No mark should be assigned for academic qualifications.	Marks for professional experience should be increased to 20.Further 5 marks may be allotted to the experience in professional category for the period spent as RMP. There should ne atleast 10 marks for	Max marks for award should not exceed 10marks. 2 marks for fellowship of any of the recognised National Academy. 1 mark each for award by national institute/Universities/professional societies.		Due weightage should be given for guiding MSc/MTech thesis also as only PhD is included in the revised score card. Minimum financial limits fixed to obtain marks under projects and institutional development activities are very high and needs to removed or reduced.	Uniformity should be followed for all scientist including social scientist as below: I.Peer reviewed publication 15 marks to other publication	

Comments on score card for the post of Director of Deemed Universities/ND & DDG/ equivalent positions and score card for the post of PD,Director,ADG & JDNI

Sl. No./	Name	Academic Qualification	Experience in professional* field	Recognitions & Awards / Special Attainments	Development of variety / breeds / technologies / patents / discoveries with documented impact at the field level / traits identified/ genes / germplasm registered / breeder seeds produced / policy paper / new theory/innovation.	Teaching / Research / Extension	Publications	Number of Comments
----------	------	------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	---------------------------------	--------------	--------------------

			feedback of scientist given at institute level and reflecting through APAR. Experience of scientist working under remote location and regional centres should be given atleast 3 marks					5 marks. Score for publications for RMPs should be split as 15 for referred journals and 5 for other publication for other than social scientist.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---